CO-CHAIR'S SUMMARY REPORT

6TH ASEAN REGIONAL FORUM INTER-SESSIONAL MEETING ON SECURITY OF AND IN THE USE OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGIES

Moscow, Russia, 24 April 2024

INTRODUCTION

1. The 6th ARF Inter-Sessional Meeting on Security of and in the Use of Information and Communication Technologies (ARF ISM on ICTs Security) was held in Moscow, Russia in hybrid format, on 24 April 2024. The Meeting was Co-Chaired by Dr. Vladimir Shin, Special Coordinator of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation (MFA of Russia) on the Issues of Political Use of Information and Communications Technologies, Deputy Director of the Department of International Information Security of the MFA of Russia, and Mrs. Adhyanti Sardanarini Wirajuda, Director for ASEAN Economic Cooperation of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. The Meeting was participated in-person by representatives from Cambodia, Indonesia, India, Russia, Thailand, and the Philippines. All ARF Participants attended via video conference except Bangladesh, DPRK, Mongolia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, and Sri Lanka. Representatives of the ASEAN Secretariat were also in attendance via video conference. The List of Delegates appears as **ANNEX 1**.

AGENDA ITEM 1:   OPENING REMARKS

2. In his opening remarks, Dr. Shin expressed appreciation towards the constructive discussions held at the 13th ARF Open-Ended Study Group on Confidence-Building Measures to Reduce the Risk of Conflict Stemming from the Use of Information and Communication Technologies (OESG) on 23 April 2024. He underscored that as the main ASEAN-led platform aimed at ensuring security of and in the use of ICTs and confidence-building in the Asia Pacific region, the ARF ISM on ICTs Security facilitated the exchange of perspectives among ARF Participants on their priorities, improved strategies, objectives, and specific limitations, and therefore contributed to the

objective of cultivating an open, safe, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful ICT environment.

3. In her opening remarks, Mrs. Wirajuda conveyed that the ISM on ICTs Security provided an excellent forum to exchange knowledge and experience, as well as to explore new approaches in addressing threats related to the security of and in the use of ICTs. She further highlighted that both past and proposed activities contributed to the objective of enhancing security of and in the use of ICTs and that engagement with relevant international bodies, primarily the United Nations should be enhanced. Mrs. Wirajuda also emphasised that collaboration and cooperation among ARF Participants were among the key factors contributing to regional and global peace and security.

AGENDA ITEM 2:   ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

4. The Meeting adopted the Agenda, which appears as **ANNEX 2**.

AGENDA ITEM 3:   DISCUSSION ON THE ACTIVITIES CONDUCTED UNDER THE ARF ISM ON SECURITY OF AND IN THE USE OF ICTs 2023–2024

3.1. ARF Series of Workshops on Terminology in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs in the Context of Confidence Building

5. The Meeting noted the outcomes of the ARF Series of Workshops on Terminology in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs in the Context of Confidence Building, with its first and second meetings conducted on 7 April 2022 and 21 June 2023, respectively. Co-chaired by Cambodia and Russia, the Workshops discussed the importance of terminology in fostering trust and cooperation, in which it was noted that there was a lack of unified glossary in the field of security of and in the use of ICTs. In this context, the Workshops advocated the importance of clear definitions of terms related to ICTs and collaboration on technology development to promote peace and confidence in international cooperation. Further, it was noted that a national survey on terminology on security of and in the use of ICTs had been conducted, through which States had provided information on terms and definitions related to security of and in the use of ICTs, including end-user practices, national legislation, and strategic doctrines, and shared experiences and challenges due to the absence of internationally approved terminology.

3.2. ARF Workshop on Fostering Professionals in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs

6. The Meeting noted that the ARF Workshop on Enhancing Professionals in the Field of ICT Security, co-chaired by the Republic of Korea (ROK) and Viet Nam in Ha Noi on 13 June 2023, served as a valuable platform for sharing insights on strategies for training experts in the field of the security of and in the use of ICTs. It was further noted that the workshop focused on the status of professionals in the security of and in the use of ICTs in the region, the private sector's role in training experts in this area and the ASEAN-targeted capacity building program in the field of security of and in the use of ICTs. The co-sponsors also informed that Singapore, the ROK and Viet Nam had shared best practices on the training and recruitment of professionals in the field of the security of and in the use of ICTs, as regional countries endeavour to digitalise their government services, economies, and industries.

3.3. ARF Series of Workshops on Countering the Use of ICTs for Criminal Purposes

7. The Meeting noted that the Workshops, co-chaired by Russia, Thailand, and China, had been aimed at strengthening international cooperation in the fight against global threat of ICT-related crime. It was noted that the Workshops had covered substantive law aspects, procedural aspects, and issues of international cooperation, featuring presentations by experts from ARF Participants, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), along with private sector and academia to share experiences and best practices in combating ICT-related crimes. The need for international cooperation, as well as mutual ICT-crime prevention measures, and the importance of facilitating knowledge sharing among experts had also been highlighted. The co-sponsors informed that the next Workshop was scheduled for May 2024 and that the invitation package would be circulated in due course.

3.4. ARF Points of Contact Directory on Security of and in the Use of ICTs

8. The Meeting took into account that as a follow-up to recent updates to the Points of Contact (POC) Directory, a basic connectivity test for the working level contacts had been conducted and that the POC Directory had been in good working order. It was noted that the test had highlighted the importance of swift responses from designated POCs. On this note, Australia and Malaysia as the co-sponsors, informed that to date, the POC Directory had included contacts from 20 ARF Participants and encouraged other ARF Participants to take part in the POC Directory. Additionally, the Meeting noted that a connectivity test at the senior-level was planned to be conducted in the near future. With regard to the establishment of a global intergovernmental POC Directory within the United Nations (UN), the co-sponsors were of the view that the ARF POC Directory provided a commendable example of regional collaboration in matters related to the security of and

in the use of ICTs. ARF Participants were encouraged to keep abreast on the progress of the global intergovernmental POC Directory and nominate diplomatic and technical points of contact for effective communications in matters related to the security of and in the use of ICTs at both regional and global levels.

3.5. ARF Workshop on the Protection of ICT-Enabled Critical Infrastructures

9. The Meeting noted that the ARF Workshop on the Protection of ICT-Enabled Critical Infrastructure, co-chaired by Singapore and the EU, aimed to facilitate exchange of views and measures on national policies and best practices to enhance the protection of critical information infrastructure, fostering mutual understanding and cooperation among ARF Participants, and encouraging meaningful participation of civil society, private sector and academia in the region in their respective roles and responsibilities with the leading role of States. The co-chairs announced that the workshop was scheduled for 6-7 June 2024 in Singapore, and that the invitation package would be circulated in due course.

AGENDA ITEM 4: DISCUSSION ON PROPOSED ACTIVITIES/CONFIDENCE BUILDING MEASURES UNDER THE ARF ISM ON SECURITY OF AND IN THE USE OF ICTS 2024 – 2025

4.1. ARF Concept Paper Workshop on National Survey of Implementation of United Nations recommendations on responsible use of ICTs by states in the context of international security

10. The Meeting noted the concept paper for an ARF Workshop on National Survey of Implementation of United Nations recommendations on responsible use of ICTs by states in the context of international security, proposed to be co-chaired by Australia, Malaysia, Singapore, and Thailand. The Meeting further noted that the proposed workshop was intended to be convened via videoconference in the second half of 2024. According to the co-sponsors, the workshop will serve as an online self-assessment tool for countries to analyse their national implementation of voluntary rules, norms and principles of responsible behaviour of States in the use of ICTs agreed within the UN. The Meeting noted the reservations raised by Russia that the proposal artificially expanded the focus of the UN voluntary, non-binding rules, norms and principles and did not reflect recent agreements made at the UN. The Meeting also noted views from other participants that the proposal was in line with the respective UNGGE and OEWG reports, notably the 2015 GGE report and the 2021 OEWG and GGE reports, as well as the two Annual Progress Reports (2022, 2023) by the current 2020-2025 OEWG. The Meeting further noted that written feedback and comments on this proposal would be submitted to the proponents.

4.2. ARF Workshop on the Capacity-Building in the field of Countering the Use of ICTs for Criminal Purposes

11. The Meeting noted that the concept paper for an ARF Workshop on the Capacity-Building in the field of Countering the Use of ICTs for Criminal Purposes, proposed by Russia, was intended to provide a platform for officials from law enforcement agencies to exchange experience on conducting investigations and forensic examinations on ICT-related criminal activities, and share best practices and methodologies on countering criminal use of ICTs. Myanmar expressed intention to co-chair this activity, Singapore and China supported the initiative. Few ARF Participants expressed their reservations as the proposed activity may duplicate efforts undertaken in other ASEAN mechanisms and would be better suited under the ARF Counter Terrorism and Transnational Crime workstream. As a co-sponsor, Russia underlined that conducting workshops on capacity-building was a cooperation area under the 2015 ARF Work Plan on Security of and in the Use of ICTs, so the ARF ISM on ICTs Security was a suitable framework for such activity. The Meeting further noted that written feedback and comments on this proposal would be submitted to the proponent.

4.3. ARF Seminar on Combating Online Scam

12. China briefed the Meeting on the proposed concept paper for an ARF Seminar on Combating Online Scams, which highlights the persistent and growing challenge of online scams, emphasising their rapid, low-cost execution and significant impact on livelihoods in the region. The proposed activity aims to foster dialogue and cooperation among regional participants, sharing best practices and strategies to combat online scams. Several ARF Participants expressed reservations towards this proposal, seeking clarification on the types of online activities addressed, clearer definitions of online scams such as the possibility of providing a list of types of frauds, integration with judicial authorities, and requested more information on the application of new technologies in law enforcement, as well as the field visit. In response, China clarified that the terminology "online scam" had been derived from a recent working group meeting and welcomed alternative language suggestions. It was noted that China had been coordinating with various regional and municipal bodies to finalise the field visit details, and intended to involve participants from diverse governmental departments to enhance cooperation between the various agencies.

13. Taking into consideration the divergent views expressed, it was noted that more time was required to study the three proposals. The Meeting noted that in line with the processes and procedures of the ARF, the Participants needed to reach a consensus

on the proposals, ideally prior to the ARF SOM, so as to allow the ARF Chair ample time to consolidate the List of Track 1 Activities for the Inter-Sessional Year 2024-2025 which would be submitted to the Ministers for approval. To further refine the proposals, the Co-Chairs requested for ARF Participants to submit written feedback and comments directly to the proponents of each proposal, with a view of reaching consensus and finalisation by 31 May 2024.

AGENDA ITEM 5:   CURRENT SITUATION IN AND PROSPECTS FOR THE GLOBAL DISCUSSION ON SECURITY OF AND IN THE USE OF ICTS

14. For the first time in the ARF ISM on ICTs Security, Indonesia briefed the Meeting on recent developments within the ASEAN, including the outcomes of the 4th ASEAN Digital Ministers Meeting (ADGMIN) in February 2024, wherein the ADGMIN acknowledged key recommendations from the ASEAN Digital Masterplan 2025 Mid-Term Review (ADM 2025 MTR). It was noted that the recommendations included, among others, the need to develop governance standards for emerging ICTs including Artificial Intelligence (AI) as well as strengthening collaboration in digital infrastructure building and maintenance. It was also noted that the 4th ADGMIN had endorsed the ASEAN Guide on Artificial Intelligence Governance and Ethics, which had set out ASEAN's approach towards governing and leveraging the power of AI, and that a new ASEAN Working Group on AI Governance would be established.

15. The Meeting took note of a briefing on recent developments within the UN context, delivered by H.E. Ambassador Burhan Gafoor, Permanent Representative of Singapore to the United Nations and Chair of the United Nations Open-Ended Working Group on Security of and in the Use of ICTs (OEWG) via video-recording. The Meeting noted that the OEWG had reached consensus on its 2nd Annual Progress Report. The briefing highlighted that ICTs, including AI, had the potential to accelerate threats related to the security of and in the use of ICTs and that there was a growing danger of misuse of ICTs particularly by States and non-State actors. Ambassador Gafoor further informed that States had agreed to establish a global POC Directory which would be officially launched on 9 May 2024 at the UN Headquarters. He further highlighted the need to strengthen cooperation and sharing of information between the ARF and the UN OEWG to ensure the future of a safe and secure ICT environment.

16. Furthermore, the discussion also highlighted several key aspects of international cooperation in the digital sphere, namely the focus on the work of the OEWG in implementing and developing norms for responsible behaviour of States. It underlined the adherence to the UN framework for responsible state behaviour in the use of ICTs. The Meeting also took note of the work undertaken by the UN Ad Hoc Committee to

Elaborate a Comprehensive International Convention on Countering the Use of Information and Communications Technologies for Criminal Purposes, including the progress and challenges in drafting a comprehensive treaty on ICT-related crime. While significant strides have been made, particularly with 70% of the draft convention being agreed ad referendum. The balance was noted that balancing the inclusion of human rights provisions with the practical necessities of combating criminal use of ICTs emerged as a critical concern to be addressed during the final negotiation session. It was emphasised that a balance was essential to ensure effective international cooperation while avoiding impediments to progress. The Meeting emphasized the need to ensure progress towards finalising the work on the future treaty and looked forward to continued cooperation by means of this international instrument as a platform for countering criminal use of ICTs.

AGENDA ITEM 6:   OTHER MATTERS

17. The Meeting noted that Indonesia and Russia's term of co-chairmanship for the ARF ISM on ICTs Security would conclude in this ISY. In this regard, the Meeting noted the expressions of interest from the Philippines and Canada to assume the co-chairmanship of the ISM on ICTs security for the next cycle. Further to this, the Co-Chairs reminded ARF Participants interested in co-chairing this ISM to inform Lao PDR as the current ARF Chair and to reiterate their interest at the upcoming ARF Inter-sessional Support Group Meeting on Confidence Building Measures and Preventive Diplomacy (ISG on CBMs and PD).

CLOSING REMARKS

18. The Co-Chairs expressed sincere appreciation for the active participation of the ARF Participants, and encouraged all ARF Participants to further strengthen cooperation and collaboration efforts to advance the objectives of the Work Plan on ICTs Security.

ISSUES TO BE FOLLOWED UP

Issues arising from the Meeting that need to be followed up are:

No.	Key Discussions/ Issues	Timeline	Follow-up by
1	Comments and input to the concept paper for the ARF Series of Workshops on Terminology in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs in the Context of Confidence Building	31 May	ARF Participants and Russia
2	Comments and input to the concept paper for the ARF Seminar on Combating Online Scam	31 May	ARF Participants and China
3	Comments and input to the concept paper for the ARF Workshop on National Survey of Implementation of United Nations recommendations on responsible use of ICTs by states in the context of international security	31 May	ARF Participants and Australia
4	Confirmation of co-chairmanship for the next cycle of the ARF ISM on ICTs Security	Prior to the 31st ARF	ARF Participants, the Philippines, and Canada

ANNEX 1: LIST OF DELEGATES

Delegation of Russia

1. Vladimir Shin – Special Coordinator of the MFA of Russia on Political Aspects of the Use of ICTs, Deputy Director of the Department of International Information Security (DIIS) of the MFA;
2. Ernest Chernukhin – Head of the division of the DIIS of the MFA;
3. Airat Abdullin – Acting head of the division of the DIIS of the MFA;
4. Lilit Arutynyan – Expert of the Ministry of Justice.

Delegation of Indonesia

5. Adhyanti Sardanarini Wirajuda – Director of ASEAN Economic Cooperation, MFA;
6. Nisrina Nuraini Nafisah – Attaché of the Directorate for ASEAN Political Security Cooperation, MFA;
7. Herfino – Counsellor of Indonesian Embassy in Moscow.

Delegation of Cambodia

8. Chhuoy Bunchheang – Under Secretary of State of Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation;
9. Kao Visal – Officer of the Department of Political-Security Community, General Department of ASEAN.

Delegation of Thailand

10. Wisit Bunyaritthipong – Counsellor, Department of ASEAN Affairs, MFA;
11. Washarin Sa-Ngiamsin – Counsellor, Embassy of Thailand in Moscow.

Delegation of Philippines

12. Jovencio Agus – Political attaché, Embassy of the Philippines in Moscow.

Delegation of India

13. Dibbada Satya Venkata Ashok – Third secretary of the Embassy of India to Moscow;
14. Abhishek Bakolia – Third secretary of the Embassy of India to Moscow.

Representatives from other ARF Participants except Bangladesh, DPRK, Mongolia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea and Sri Lanka, as well as the ASEAN Secretariat joined the meeting online.

ANNEX 2: AGENDA

Moscow time (UTC+3)	Agenda	
9.30-10.00	**Connecting to the meeting**	
10.00 – 10.10 (10 minutes)	**Agenda Item 1**	Opening Remarks by co-chairs **[Indonesia, Russia]**
10.10 – 10.20 (10 minutes)	**Agenda Item 2**	Adoption of the Agenda **[Chair: Russia]**
10.20 – 11.00 (40 minutes)	**Agenda Item 3**	**Discussion on the activities conducted under the ARF ISM on Security of and in the Use of ICTs 2023 – 2024 [Chair: Indonesia]** i. ARF Series of Workshops on Terminology in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs in the Context of Confidence Building, April 2023, online [Co-lead Countries: Cambodia, Russia] ii. ARF Series of Workshops on Countering the Use of ICTs for Criminal Purposes, date, online [Co-lead Countries: Thailand, China, Russia] iii. ARF Workshop on Fostering Professionals in the Field of Security of and in the Use of ICTs, 13 June 2023, Hanoi, Vietnam [Co-lead Countries: Vietnam, ROK] iv. ARF Points of Contact Directory on ICTs Security [Co-lead Countries: Malaysia, Australia] v. ARF Workshop on the Protection of ICT-Enabled Critical Infrastructures [Co-lead Countries: Singapore, EU]
11.00 – 11.40 (40 minutes)	**Agenda Item 4**	**Discussion on proposed activities/confidence building measures under the ARF ISM on Security of and in the Use of ICTs 2024 – 2025 [Chair: Russia]** i. ARF Concept Paper Workshop on National Survey of Implementation of United Nations recommendations on responsible use of ICTs by

		states in the context of international security [Co-lead Countries: Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand, Australia] ii. ARF Workshop on the Capacity-Building in the field of Countering the Use of ICTs for Criminal Purposes (Russia to brief) iii. ARF Seminar on Combating Online Scam (China to brief) iv. ARF Participants are encouraged to introduce their proposed activities
11.40 – 12.00 (20 minutes)		**Break**
12.00 – 12.30 (30 minutes)	**Agenda Item 5**	**Current situation in and prospects for the global discussion on Security of and in the Use of ICTs [Chair: Indonesia]** i. The latest developments within the UN Open-Ended Working Group on security of and in the use of ICTs (H.E. Amb. Gafoor – TBC) ii. Updates of the work of the UN Ad Hoc Committee to elaborate international comprehensive convention on countering the use of ICTs for criminal purposes
12.30 – 12.40 (10 minutes)	**Agenda Item 6**	**Other Matters [Chair: Russia]** i. Conclusion and Announcement of the Co-Chairs for the next inter-sessional 2024-2025 years (Russia and Indonesia to brief)
12.40 – 12.45 (5 minutes)	**Agenda Item 7**	**Closing [Indonesia, Russia]**