

**Co-Chairs' Summary Report of
the Eleventh ASEAN Regional Forum Inter-Sessional Meeting on
Counter-Terrorism and Transnational Crime
Ha Noi, Viet Nam, 4-5 March 2013**

Introduction

1. Pursuant to the decision of the 19th Ministerial Meeting of the ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) held in Phnom Penh on 12 July 2012, the Eleventh ARF Inter-Sessional Meeting on Counter-Terrorism and Transnational Crime (ISM on CTTC) was held in Ha Noi, Viet Nam, on 4-5 March 2013. The Meeting was co-chaired by Mr. Vu Ho, Deputy Director-General, Department of ASEAN Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Viet Nam, and Mr. Peter Shannon, Assistant Secretary, Counter-Terrorism Branch, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade of Australia.

2. Representatives from all ARF participants except Bangladesh, Cambodia, the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, India, Myanmar and Timor-Leste attended the meeting. Representatives of the ASEAN Secretariat were also present.

Agenda Item 1: Welcome and Opening Statements from ARF ISM on CTTC co-chairs

3. Lt. Gen. Dr. Tran Viet Tan, Deputy Minister of Public Security of Vietnam, delivered his welcome remarks. He underlined the advances in science and technology which have created new forms and increasingly sophisticated modes of terrorism and transnational crime. Hence there is a need to utilise mechanisms of international cooperation, such as the ARF, to address these new challenges. He noted the progress of ARF cooperation and initiatives in counter-terrorism and transnational crime; looked forward to the Meeting sharing information on complex forms of terrorism and transnational crime in the region; and welcomed the review of the implementation of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC.

4. In his welcoming remarks, Mr. Peter Shannon, the Australian co-chair, recalled the framework for ARF cooperation in CTTC as established in the ARF Vision Statement 2020 and the Hanoi Plan of Action to Implement the ARF Vision Statement in accordance with international and national laws and regulation. He also recalled the development of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC and its four priority areas of illicit drugs, CBRN, cyber security and counter-radicalisation which would provide the framework of discussions at this meeting. He emphasised the need to review and update the Work Plan for the coming years. He underscored the theme of this Meeting: the key trends in transnational crime in East Asia and the Pacific. He also looked forward to UNODC's forthcoming release of the Transnational Organized Crime Threat Assessment for East Asia and the Pacific in April 2013.

5. The Meeting considered and adopted the updated Provisional Agenda which appears as **ANNEX A**.

Agenda Item 2: ARF Priorities for 2013

6. As the current ASEAN and ARF Chair, Brunei Darussalam underlined the ARF's commitment to foster cooperation as outlined on the Hanoi Plan of Action, including addressing counter-terrorism and transnational crime challenges. Brunei Darussalam recalled the decision of the ARF Ministers in Phnom Penh on 12 July 2012 to promote synergy between the ARF and the ADMM-Plus. In this regard, Brunei Darussalam welcomed the participation of the Co-Chairs of the ADMM-Plus Experts' Working Group on Counter Terrorism (EWG on CT) for the first time in the ARF ISM on CTTC. Brunei Darussalam also recalled the ARF Ministers' decision to implement the ARF Work Plan on Preventive Diplomacy and to follow up on the development of an ARF Work Plan on Cyber Security. With regard to the 20th anniversary of the ARF this year, Brunei Darussalam reiterated their invitation for ARF participants to submit their contributions to the Commemorative Publication.

Agenda Item 3: Assessment of key trends in transnational crime in East Asia and the Pacific

3.1. Expert presentations

7. Mr. Peter Shannon provided a brief overview of the upcoming UNODC publication on Transnational Organized Crime Threat Assessment in East Asia and the Pacific. The publication would supplement the UN Global Threat Assessment and for the first time track trends of transnational crime in the region. He outlined the main themes of the Assessment, namely People, Drugs, the Environment, and Goods, and noted the twelve chapters covering the relevant transnational crimes affecting the region. He underscored that the document would provide a useful analytical reference and source of data to assist policymakers tackle these crimes.

8. Ms. Jessica Graham from the Bureau of International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs of the United States Department of State delivered a presentation on wildlife trafficking from a law enforcement and transnational crime perspective. She highlighted the profitability of wildlife trafficking which puts it in the top five most lucrative transnational crime behind money laundering, drug trafficking and counterfeit goods, and arising from factors such as the rise of disposable income in South-East Asia and East Asia. She pointed out that wildlife trafficking is a multi-dimensional and cross-cutting issue that affects economic, social, environmental, and security areas. She suggested ways to combat wildlife trafficking included by tackling corruption, targeting transnational organised criminal networks, tracking internet transactions and following the monetary trails of these transactions, sharing information between relevant and related agencies, strengthening law enforcement responses and investigations, and strengthening criminal legal proceedings. She noted the initiatives of the United States Department of State in combating wildlife trafficking through, among others, bilateral and multilateral engagements and conducting regional training in Africa and Asia, and highlighted the need for collective action to address this transnational crime. She also introduced a concept paper for a proposed APEC Pathfinder Project on Combating Corruption and Illicit Trade, with a focus on wildlife trafficking and encouraged ARF participants to take part in the project's activities.

9. The Meeting exchanged views on the current international legal framework to counter wildlife trafficking; the extent of the involvement of terrorist networks in wildlife trafficking; the current state of international law enforcement efforts and cooperation against wildlife trafficking; and the potential contribution of the ARF in addressing and combating wildlife trafficking. The Meeting also took note of the recommendation to discuss the issue of wildlife trafficking at the next ARF ISM on CTTC, including undertaking presentation by the United States work underway in other fora and an assessment of what the ISM on CTTC could do to support this work.

10. Mr. Steve Killelea, Executive Chairman of the Institute for Economics and Peace, presented an overview of the inaugural Global Terrorism Index which was launched in December 2012. The Index provides a statistical analysis to the causes of terrorism and utilises a comprehensive ranking of 158 countries based on four indicators, namely the total number of terrorist incidents, fatalities, injuries, and estimated property damage. He presented several statistical highlights of the Index, including countries most and least affected by terrorism, the targets of terrorist attacks, the types of weapons used, and the ideological motivations of terrorism.

11. The Meeting welcomed the publication of the Global Terrorism Index and looked forward to further editions in the coming years. Some participants sought further clarification on the methodology of collecting and analysing data; the differentiation between international and domestic terrorism; and the criteria of what is considered as a success in terms of terrorist incidents or counter-terrorist operations. Mr Killelea agreed to distribute the next publication of the Index at the next ISM on CTTC, including a special lift-out relevant for the Asia Pacific and ARF membership.

3.2. Country presentations

12. The Meeting acknowledged the current security situation and identified several major trends in transnational crime, including terrorism and terrorism financing; migrant smuggling; trafficking in persons; trafficking of illicit drugs; money laundering; cybercrime; internet and telecom fraud; illegal gambling; document fraud; credit card fraud; organ smuggling; CBRN-related crime; and wildlife trafficking. Criminal organisations and terrorist groups continue to operate with even greater scope, complexity and sophistication due to advances in information technology and the proliferation of readily-available information in the internet. Participants shared their views and experiences in addressing these trends through both national and regional initiatives and programs and stressed the importance of regular interaction and cooperation between ARF participants on this issue, bilaterally and with multilateral organisations.

13. The Meeting acknowledged the successful efforts in addressing maritime security, particularly piracy at sea in South-East Asia, through strengthened cooperation and information exchange to address its root causes. In addition, the Meeting was encouraged to continue promoting information sharing in the maritime domain.

14. The Meeting also acknowledged the threat posed by nuclear terrorism and the critical importance of preventing nuclear and radiological materials from being misused.

15. The Meeting was of the view that the trafficking of illicit drugs constitutes a threat to national and regional security due to the proliferation of traffickers and the increase in violence. The Meeting expressed concern over the increase of opiate cultivation; and the use of crystal methamphetamine and its precursor compounds. Participants also recognised the impact of globalisation in enabling drug traffickers to expand their activities beyond national borders.

16. On the issue of cybercrime and cybersecurity, the Meeting welcomed the initiative by Malaysia, Australia and Russia to develop the ARF Work Plan on Cyber Security, which is expected to be completed in 2014. The Meeting was also informed of the 3rd International Cyberspace Conference which will be convened in October 2013 in Seoul, Republic of Korea. The conference will build on the discussions of the previous Cyberspace Conferences in London and Budapest. ARF participants were encouraged to participate in the conference.

17. The Meeting shared views and experiences on national efforts to combat home-grown and transnational terrorist groups which continue to pose a threat, including through the suppression of terrorism financing; de-radicalisation and counter-radicalisation of terrorists and terrorist suspects; and the strengthening of national criminal legislation and criminal justice systems. Several participants urged the Meeting to avoid the stereotyping of terrorists based on race, religion, or ideology, recalling one of the outcomes of a counter-radicalisation workshop hosted by Malaysia and Japan in Tokyo in February 2013. It was noted that this workshop was not able to be conducted as an official ARF event as initially intended due to logistical constraints.

18. The Meeting discussed the dangers of illicit trade activities and practices which prey upon legitimate businesses; create a culture of corruption; and are potentially disruptive to countries' economies.

19. The Meeting welcomed the European Union's CBRN Centre of Excellence (CoE) initiative and noted the suggestion to incorporate relevant ARF-related projects within the, recently opened, CBRN CoE for Southeast Asian Manila into the new ARF Work Plan on CTTC 2013-2014.

20. The Meeting recognised the linkages between various transnational crimes, such as the nexus between terrorism; migrant smuggling; drugs trafficking; and money laundering. Strengthened cooperation through increased information sharing by ARF participants is crucial to identify the best approaches in addressing these crimes. In this regard, the Meeting noted the information from the United States on the workshop to develop the concepts of the ARF Transnational Threat Information-sharing Center (ATTIC) as endorsed by the 19th ARF in July 2012. The Meeting encouraged ASEAN ARF participants to co-chair the workshop with the United States.

21. The Meeting noted the presentations by Australia, Canada, China, the European Union, Indonesia, Japan, Lao PDR, Malaysia, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, the Philippines, the Republic of Korea, Russia, Singapore, Sri Lanka, Thailand, the United States, and Viet Nam under this agenda item. The presentation papers from Australia and the United States appear as **ANNEXES B and C.**

Agenda Item 4: Review of implementation of ARF Work Plan on CTTC

4.1. ASEAN Secretariat review of ARF Work Plan on CTTC

22. The ASEAN Secretariat presented a review of the implementation of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC 2011-2012, highlighting the status of lead countries for the priority areas, completed and pending projects and activities under each priority area. The Meeting took note of the three challenges identified and six suggestions raised by the ASEAN Secretariat to consider when drafting the new Work Plan. The three challenges are as follows:

- a. Nomination of Lead Countries for Illicit Drugs. Currently, there is no non-ASEAN Lead Country on this priority area;
- b. Insufficient volunteerism by ARF participants. Only a few ARF participants have volunteered to lead the implementation of the Work Plan's priority areas and proposed activities under these areas.
- c. Delay in submitting proposals for activities.

The Meeting also took note of the six suggestions are as follows:

- a. Consider having a longer timeframe for the implementation of activities;
- b. Focus priority areas on issues where the ARF could bring most added value;
- c. Consider aligning the ARF CTTC Work Plan's priority areas with the priority areas of the ASEAN Senior Officials' Meeting on Transnational Crime (SOMTC), namely 1) terrorism; 2) illicit drug trafficking; 3) trafficking in persons; 4) arms smuggling; 5) sea piracy; 6) money laundering; 7) international economic crime; and 8) cybercrime;
- d. Confirm the lead countries for each priority area before submitting the Work Plan for the Ministers' adoption;
- e. Encourage lead countries to play a more active role in initiating activities or inviting other ARF participants to propose activities; and
- f. Submit proposals for activities ahead of the ARF ISG or ARF SOM of the current inter-sessional year to be considered for endorsement and implementation in the next inter-sessional year.

4.2. Review of the implementation of projects by priority area

4.2.1. Illicit Drugs (*Thailand*)

23. The Meeting took note of the briefing by Thailand on the priority area of Illicit Drugs. Thailand presented its status on illicit drugs, including the number of cases, modality and measures implemented by Thailand at the national level. Thailand also presented the mechanisms for working towards Drug Free ASEAN 2015, such as border security control over land, air and water (both inland water and the sea).

Thailand also mentioned the input required to increase coordination of systematic intelligence, provision of technical assistance, qualified personnel and adequate budget. The presentation also highlighted some of the regional and international fora where ASEAN Member States discuss efforts to combat illicit drug matters.

24. Russia noted that the trafficking of illicit drugs from Afghanistan constitutes a serious threat to regional security and stability. In this regard, Russia, as the incoming President of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF), invited ARF participants who are members of the FATF and FATF-style Regional Bodies, to contribute to Russia's project in FATF on illicit financial flows from Afghan drug production and trafficking.

25. The Meeting also noted Thailand's suggestion for ARF participants to provide more cost-sharing support for efforts against illicit drugs, particularly in capacity building and strengthening of information and intelligence networks.

4.2.2. CBRN (*Philippines and the United States*)

26. The Philippines and the United States reported on the ARF Workshop on Preparedness and Response to a Biological Event which was held in Manila on 5-7 September 2012, co-chaired by the Philippines, the United States and Australia. The Workshop was the fourth in a series of biosecurity-themed workshops under the CBRN priority area. The Meeting took note of the draft Best Practices for Preparedness and Response to a Biological Event which was prepared by the co-chairs of the Workshop. Participants were invited to comment on the draft Best Practices before the next ARF ISG on CBMs and PD. The draft Best Practices appears as **ANNEX D.**

27. The Philippines and the United States introduced the Concept Paper for an ARF Cross-Sectoral Security Cooperation on Bio-Preparedness and Disaster Response, as a continuation of the progress in the CBRN priority area. Participants were invited to comment on the Concept Paper before the next ARF ISG on CBMs and PD. The Concept Paper appears as **ANNEX E.**

28. The Meeting noted the recommendation to align the activities of the CBRN priority area with the efforts of the ARF Inter-Sessional Meeting on Non-Proliferation and Disarmament (ISM on NPD) and the ARF Work Plan on NPD.

4.2.3. Counter Radicalisation (*Malaysia and Japan*)

29. Malaysia and Japan informed the Meeting that the Workshop on Countering Radicalisation was held in Tokyo on 4-5 February 2013. The Meeting noted the outcomes of the Workshop which was held outside the ARF framework due to technical reasons; and encouraged ARF participants to continue work under the Counter Radicalisation priority area.

30. The Meeting took note of the information by Canada on the convening of a Symposium on Measuring the Effectiveness of Countering Violent Extremism (CVE) Programming in Ottawa on 27-28 March 2013. ARF participants were invited to

attend the Symposium which is held under the Global Counter-Terrorism Forum (GCTF) framework.

4.2.4. Cybersecurity and Cyberterrorism (*Malaysia, Russia and Australia*)

31. Australia briefed the Meeting on the outcomes of completed activities held under the Cybersecurity and Cyberterrorism priority area for the period of 2011-2012. The activities are as follows:

- a. ARF Workshop on Proxy Actors in Cyberspace, Quang Nam, 14-15 April 2012 (co-chaired by Viet Nam and the United States);
- b. ARF Workshop on Cyber Incident Response, Singapore, 6-7 September 2012 (co-chaired by Singapore and Australia);
- c. ARF Seminar on Confidence-Building Measures in Cyberspace, Seoul, 11-12 September 2012 (co-chaired by Malaysia and the Republic of Korea).

4.2.4.1. Draft ARF Work Plan on Cyber Security (*Australia*)

32. The Meeting took note of the paper by Australia on the Development of the ARF Work Plan on Cyber Security. The Paper builds on Australia's Non-Paper regarding Possible Implementation of the Ministerial Statement on Ensuring Cyber Security and Development of the Work Plan on Cyber Security, which was circulated during the ARF ISG on CBMs and PD in Bandar Seri Begawan in November 2012. The Paper outlines the objectives and the development timeframe of the Work Plan. Australia proposed that the Work Plan be completed before the 21st ARF in 2014. The Paper is attached as **ANNEX F**.

33. The Meeting noted Russia's view that the title of the Work Plan should be in compliance with the ARF Statement on Cooperation in Ensuring Cyber Security, namely the "ARF Work Plan on Security in the Use of ICTs".

34. Several participants requested clarification on whether the Work Plan on Cyber Security would fall under the ambit of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC. Australia confirmed that the proposed Work Plan is intended to be a subset of the Cybersecurity and Cyberterrorism priority area of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC though Australia noted that it was up to the ISM to agree if it should have some other structure.

35. The Meeting welcomed the efforts of the Cybersecurity and Cyberterrorism co-leads in developing the ARF Work Plan on Cyber Security and looked forward to the initial draft in due course.

4.2.5. Development of ARF Work Plan on CTTC

36. The Co-Chairs informed the Meeting that the ARF Work Plan on CTTC 2011-2012 will be updated to reflect the forthcoming ARF calendar and will incorporate input and suggestions from ARF participants, particularly lead countries of the priority areas. The meeting took note of the suggestion that the implementation and activities of the Work Plan may extend beyond the next 2013-14 ARF calendar. The updated ARF Work Plan on CTTC 2013-2014 will be circulated to ARF participants before the next ARF ISG on CBMs and PD. Participants were invited to submit their

inputs and comments to Viet Nam and Australia as the proponents of the ARF Work Plan on CTTC 2013-2014.

37. The Meeting welcomed Thailand's offer to continue as lead country for the Illicit Drugs priority area and encouraged non-ASEAN ARF participants to join Thailand as co-lead country.

Future Direction of ARF ISM on CTTC

4.3. Update on the Implementation of Hanoi Plan of Action to Implement ARF Vision Statement 2020

38. The co-chair provided an overview of the implementation of the Hanoi Plan of Action as a point of reference for the ISM on CTTC and the implementation of the ARF Vision Statement 2020.

4.4. Linkages with other mechanisms/forums

4.4.1. ADMM-Plus Experts' Working Group on Counter Terrorism (*Indonesia and the United States*)

39. The Meeting welcomed the presentation by Indonesia and the United States as the Co-Chairs of the ADMM-Plus EWG on CT as part of the efforts to promote synergies between the ARF and the ADMM-Plus. The presentation provided an overview of the activities of the EWG on CT since its inception, including the first and second EWG on CT meetings in 2011 and 2012 respectively, and the upcoming EWG on CT Counter-Terrorism Exercise (CTX) which will be held at the Indonesia Peace and Security Centre (IPSC) in Bogor, Indonesia on 9-13 September 2013.

40. Some participants suggested that since the ARF and ADMM-Plus have different memberships and cover different aspects of defence cooperation, the two fora should proceed with their respective activities without being too concerned over possible and potential overlaps.

4.4.3. Others – Global Counter-Terrorism Forum South-East Asia Working Group (*Indonesia and Australia*)

41. The Meeting noted the briefing by Indonesia and Australia on the activities of the GCTF South-East Asia Working Group, including the inaugural meeting in Semarang in March 2012, the second meeting in Manila in November 2012 and the Workshop on Prison Practitioners in Sydney in November 2012. The Meeting took note of the stocktaking project on counter-terrorism activities in South-East Asia undertaken by New Zealand and the invitation by Indonesia to the upcoming Workshop for First Responders of Victims of Terrorism which is tentatively scheduled for June or July 2013.

42. The Meeting expressed support for the convening of the 13th SOMTC which has been tentatively scheduled in June 2013 in Viet Nam, and the 9th ASEAN Ministerial Meeting on Transnational Crime (AMMTC) in September 2013 in Lao PDR.

Agenda Item 5: Other Matters

5.1. ARF Meeting on Cyber Security (*China*)

43. China updated the Meeting on the preparations for the ARF Meeting on Cyber Security which is tentatively to be held in the fourth quarter of 2013. The Meeting welcomed the offer from Malaysia to co-chair the Meeting with China and looked forward to the updated concept paper for the meeting to be circulated in due course.

5.2. Date and venue for the next ARF ISM on CTTC

44. The Meeting encouraged ARF participants to volunteer for the co-chairmanship of the 12th ARF ISM on CTTC before the 20th ARF.

Agenda Item 6: Closing Remarks

45. The Meeting expressed gratitude to Viet Nam and Australia for their effective co-chairmanship. They also thanked the Government of Viet Nam for the generous hospitality and excellent arrangements in hosting the 11th ARF ISM on CTTC.

■ ■ ■