

CO-CHAIRS' SUMMARY REPORT
ASEAN REGIONAL FORUM CONFERENCE ON TERRORIST USE OF THE
INTERNET

Bali, Indonesia

6-8 November 2008

1. Pursuant to the decision of the 15th ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) Ministerial Conference in Singapore in July 24, 2008, Australia and Indonesia co-chaired an ARF Workshop on countering terrorist use of the Internet in Bali on 6-8 November 2008. Representatives participated from Australia, Bangladesh, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, China, the European Union, India, Indonesia, Japan, ROK, Lao [PDRs](#), [Malaysia](#), Mongolia, New Zealand, [Pakistan](#), the Philippines, Russian Federation, Singapore, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Timor-Leste, the United States, Vietnam, and the ASEAN Secretariat. Cambodia, Democratic People's Republic of Korea (DPRK), Myanmar and Papua New Guinea (PNG) were absent. The List of Delegates appears as **Annex 1**. Participants thanked Australia and Indonesia for the excellent arrangements and hospitality in hosting the event.

Opening Remarks

2. Mr. Primo Alui Joelianto, Indonesia's ARF SOM Leader, and Director-General of Asia Pacific and Africa delivered the welcoming address, noting the importance of bilateral and regional cooperation between governments on this issue, but also the central role that non-government organizations could play, both the private and the volunteer sectors. Ambassador Primo underlined the continuing need for capacity building in sectors such as law enforcement, citing the example of the Indonesian-Australian joint initiative of the Jakarta Centre for Law Enforcement Cooperation (JCLEC) and its extensive regional training program, and looked to the ARF to play a role in raising regional awareness of the need to counter terrorist use of the internet (text appears as **Annex 2**).

3. Mr. Greg Ralph, Director Counter-Terrorism Activities at Australia's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade and Mr. Ibnu Hadi, Director Intra-Regional Cooperation in Asia-Pacific and Africa of Indonesia's Department of Foreign Affairs, made opening remarks, noting the ARF Work-Plan on Counter-Terrorism and Trans-national Crimes (CTTC) endorsed by the 15th ARF Ministerial Conference last July 2008, and hoping that this Conference would lead to progress on that work-plan that could be reported back to Ministers.

Terrorist Use of the Internet: Overview, Case Studies, Extremist Propaganda, Radicalization and Recruitment:

4. Mr. James Stinson, consultant from SRA International, took the Conference through the developments of the physical infrastructure of the Net, from its early days as DARPA-Net, underlined how terrorists had begun to make use of the potential of the Net

very early and how technological advances had affected groups' modus operandi. He also demonstrated how, outside of terrorist groups, technology such as FaceBook had enabled almost immediate mass movements, citing the example of the April 6 movement in Egypt. Mr. Stinson showed how terrorists had developed decentralized collection, analysis and targeting networks, and noted that such 'learning networks' were difficult for officials, more used to hierarchical structures, to track. He observed that the international nature of the problem meant that international cooperation was required in sharing information to successfully counter terrorists' use of the Net.

The Role of the Internet in Radicalization: A Case Study

5. Assistant Professor Merlyna Lim, of Arizona State University, provided a survey of the Internet and radical fundamentalism and extremism, using some Southeast Asian examples, demonstrating how the Internet as a medium functioned in a socio-cultural context. She spoke of the importance of communications and the media in countering extremists' strategy, showing the importance they place on media in facilitating their overall goals, and how the Internet functioned as an important part of that strategy, even in countries with low current access to the Net. Professor Lim updated participants on likely directions and developments, with Web 2.0 (i.e. social-networking of all kinds, including Blogging, Youtube, Twitter, and Plurk) evolving rapidly. She contrasted the depiction of real-world events, in the global flow of ideas with networked and segmented extremist spheres. Professor Lim stressed the importance of the role that the wider community had to play in combating violent extremism of all kinds.

Strategies for Combating Terrorist Use of the Net

6. Mr. Stinson began the second day's program by sketching out the extent of the technological and organizational challenges that faced government agencies in adapting themselves to combating terrorists' use of the Net, especially the imperative to keep up with technology. He provided practical advice on setting up collection and analysis systems and organizing teams to tackle the problem successfully. He provided a range of advice on ways of coping with the problem of ever increasing amounts of data, and providing analyzed intelligence product to customers in a useable format. Participants were grateful for the electronic copies of his extensive presentations, and additional background reading material (distributed at the time).

7. Mr. Edmon Makarim, Special Adviser to the Indonesian Department of Communications and Information, and Lecturer at the University of Indonesia, provided the Conference with a summary of the legal tools available to Indonesia to prosecute those either planning attacks on critical information infrastructure, or disseminating illegal content via the internet. Mr. Makarim provided some illuminating examples of successful prosecutions that had taken place in Indonesia, including one involving www.anshar.net. In discussions Mr. Makarim also underlined the need to empower mainstream elements in society, and give a voice to responsible religious leaders. The presentation appears as **Annex 3**.

8. Mr. Makarim's presentation was expanded upon by Mr. Faisal Thayeb, of the Indonesian National Police HQ Cyber-Crime Unit. Mr. Thayeb spoke of the Indonesian Police's work in monitoring terrorist group websites that had been operating in Indonesia, resulting in successful disruption operations and subsequent prosecutions. Mr. Thayeb noted that Indonesia had this year introduced laws enabling the presentation of digital evidence in courts of law. The Presentation appears as **Annex 4**.

9. Mr. Manuel Lezertua, Director Legal Advice and Public International Law of the Council of Europe, outlined the provisions of the two most relevant conventions originating from the Council, those being the Convention on the Prevention of Terrorism, and the Convention on Cyber-Crime. Mr. Lezertua noted that a number of ARF participants were already party to the Convention on Cyber-Crime (also open to countries not members, or observers of the Council) or were well advanced in the process. Participants considered that the wide-ranging provisions of these two conventions, especially those articles relating to provocation, recruitment, and training of potential terrorists as well as support to victims of terrorism, made them a basis worth exploring further to develop a coherent legal response framework in the region.

10. The US also observed that many ARF participant nations were parties to the 2002 Information Sharing Agreement, which explicitly recognized cyber-terrorism as a problem, noting that this could also serve as a regional basis for information sharing. The US noted that more operational information sharing was required to bridge the gap. Mr. Lezertua noted that the Council of Europe was prepared to look at requests for assistance in capacity building, ideally in conjunction with other donors, so as to enable countries seeking to become parties to meet the requisite criteria, especially in drafting domestic legislation.

The Role of the ARF in Countering Terrorist Use of the Internet

11. A vigorous discussion ensued on what role the ARF could play in facilitating collaboration and cooperation, in countering terrorist use of the Net, and a number of recommendations were put forward:

- a) The Conference recommended exploring the use of existing training centers in ARF Participating Countries for training on countering terrorist use of the internet
 - i. The Conference also recommended that such training could usefully focus on investigative techniques for dealing with cyber crime and computer forensics
- b) The Conference recommended that ARF Participating Countries explore the possibility of elaboration and establishment of a regional legal framework in the sphere of countering terrorist use of the internet
 - i. The Conference considered that the two appropriate Council of Europe conventions could form a useful basis for this work, in particular the Convention on Cyber Crime, which is open to accession by all countries. The Council of Europe is willing to assist those ARF Participating Countries through its existing capacity building programs.

- c) The Conference recommended that ARF participants explore the possibility of proactively addressing the issue of capacity building, initiating joint training, R&D programs and technology transfer.
 - d) The Conference noted that in addition to the international organizations already mentioned, there were a number of other international and regional organizations which had the potential to support ARF activities and initiatives, such as the UN (and its various bodies including UNODC , CTTF and CTED) and the ITU.
 - e) The Conference agreed to produce a list of contact points who are responsible for the terrorist use of the internet in each ARF Participating Country to complement the ARFs' list of contact points of cyber terrorism undertaken by the Republic of Korea. The list appears as **Annex 5**.
12. The Conference agreed to adopt the Co-Chairs Summary Report of the workshop and asked the co-chairs to brief the next ARF Inter-sessional Conference on Counter-Terrorism and Transnational Crime, to be held in Vietnam in the first half of 2009.
13. The Conference concluded with a field trip the site of the 2002 Bali Bombings, which underlined to participants the gravity of the issues discussed in the workshop.
